

**VENTURA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL (RFP) FOR
TRIENNIAL PERFORMANCE AUDITS OF THE VENTURA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION (VCTC) AND VENTURA COUNTY TDA CLAIMANTS**

INTRODUCTION

The Ventura County Transportation Commission (VCTC), which serves as the Regional Transportation Planning Agency (RTPA) for Ventura County, is required by Section 99246 of the California Public Utilities Code (the “Transportation Development Act”, hereinafter “TDA”) to triennially designate an entity other than itself to conduct a performance audit of its activities. Operators that receive funding under Article 4 of the TDA are required to have a performance audit. Between fiscal years (FY) 2020 and 2022, this includes:

- Gold Coast Transit District (GCTD)
- Thousand Oaks Transit (eligible for both article 4 & 8)
- Simi Valley Transit

The following agencies are sub recipients to GCTD and will need to be audited through GCTD.

- County of Ventura
- City of Ojai
- City of Oxnard
- City of San Buenaventura
- City of Port Hueneme

Claimants that receive funding under Article 4.5, Article 8, or STA funds are not statutorily required to have a performance audit; however, to enable a comprehensive and objective review that serves the benefit of both the RTPA and the transit provider, performance audits should be conducted of all operators that are allocated funding under the TDA. These claimants include:

- VCTC Intercity Service
- Camarillo Area Transit
- Moorpark City Transit
- City of Fillmore
- City of Santa Paula
- Valley Express
- ECTA

Currently there are no Article 4.5 claimants in Ventura County for this audit period.

VCTC is therefore seeking proposals to conduct performance audits of itself, as the RTPA, and its TDA claimants. The final products of this RFP will be completion of performance audits for VCTC and its

claimants covering Fiscal Years 19/20, 20/21 and 21/22. The audits must be conducted in compliance with relevant sections of the Transportation Development Act and shall evaluate the efficiency, effectiveness, and economy of the operation of the entity being audited. They shall be conducted in accordance with the efficiency, economy, and program results portions of the Comptroller General's "Standards for Audit of Governmental Organizations, Programs, Activities, and Functions."

TDA legislation specific to Ventura County

Effective July 1, 2014, special TDA legislation went into effect specific to Ventura County. Senate Bill 203 (SB 203) amended SB 716 to allow cities under 100,000 population and not a part of the Gold Coast Transit District (i.e. Camarillo, Fillmore, Moorpark and Santa Paula) to continue to claim TDA funds for local streets as long as the entity's reasonable transit needs are met. Senate Bill 644 created the Gold Coast Transit District (GCTD) consisting of the County of Ventura and the cities of Ojai, Oxnard, Port Hueneme and San Buenaventura. Effective July 1, 2019, Senate Bill 848 allowed the City of Thousand Oaks (even though it is over 100,000 population), to claim TDA funds for local streets as long as their reasonable transit needs are met.

VCTC, in accordance with Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, 78 Stat. 252, 42 U.S.C. 2000d to 2000d-4 and Title 49, Code of Federal Regulations, Department of Transportation, Subtitle A, Office of the Secretary, Part 21, notifies all proposers that it will affirmatively insure that, in any contract entered into pursuant to this advertisement, disadvantaged business enterprises will be afforded full opportunity to submit proposals in response to this invitation and will not be discriminated against on the grounds of race, religion, color, sex or national origin in consideration for award.

SCOPE OF WORK

Public Utilities Code Section 99246 states that the performance audit shall evaluate the efficiency, effectiveness and economy of the operation being audited. In addition, the audits must be conducted in conformance with the Comptroller General's "Standards for Audit of Governmental Organizations, Programs, Activities, and Functions." The Consultant shall, at a minimum, include the following work elements:

1. Performance Audit of VCTC

1.1. Determine Compliance with Legal and Regulatory Requirements

The consultant will be required to review and determine all TDA claimants' compliance with the Transportation Development Act and related sections of the California Code of Regulations. The specific Code Sections for which compliance is to be verified are those specified within the Transportation Development Act. Should the consultant identify instances of non-compliance, a finding regarding the non-compliance should be made in the audit report.

1.2. Follow-up on Prior Year Performance Audit Recommendations

The consultant will review the most recent prior performance audits for VCTC and assess the implementation of audit recommendations. The auditor will need to make determinations as to whether recommendations, which have not been implemented, are:

- a) no longer applicable,
- b) infeasible, or
- c) should still be implemented.

If a prior audit recommendation has not been implemented but still has merit, the consultant should include the prior audit recommendation in the current audit report. The consultant will evaluate recommendations, which have been implemented or are being implemented. For these recommendations, the consultant should assess the benefits provided (or likely to be provided) by the recommendation. Significant accomplishments in implementing prior recommendations should be recognized.

1.3. Review VCTC Functions

The consultant will review each VCTC TDA-related function consistent with the efficiency, economy, and program results portions of the Comptroller General's "Standards for Audit of Governmental Organizations, Programs, Activities, and Functions." The functional review is expected to include interviews with VCTC management and staff.

Such concerns of inefficient or ineffective performance should lead to further investigation. The detailed investigation of functional concerns, problems, and potential improvements should make up the basis of most findings in the audit report.

2. Performance Audit of Transit Operators

2.1. Determine Compliance with Statutory and Regulatory Requirements

The consultant will be required to review and determine the operator's compliance with the Transportation Development Act and related sections of the California Code of Regulations. At a minimum, the Code Sections for which compliance is to be verified are those specified within the Transportation Development Act. Should the consultant identify instances of non-compliance, a finding regarding the non-compliance should be made in the audit report.

2.2. Follow-up Prior Performance Audit Recommendations

The consultant will review the most recent prior performance audits for the operator and assess the operators' implementation of audit recommendations. The auditor will need to make determinations as to whether recommendations, which have not been implemented, are

- a) no longer applicable,
- b) infeasible, or

c) should still be implemented.

If a prior audit recommendation has not been implemented but still has merit, the consultant should include the prior audit recommendation in the current audit report. The consultant will evaluate recommendations, which have been implemented or are being implemented. For these recommendations, the consultant should assess the benefits provided (or likely to be provided) by the recommendation. Significant accomplishments in implementing prior recommendations should be recognized.

2.3. Verify Performance Indicators

As part of the performance audit, Section 99246 of the Public Utilities Code requires verification of five performance indicators: operating cost per passenger; operating cost per vehicle service hour; passengers per vehicle service hour; passengers per vehicle service mile; and vehicle service hours per employee. The consultant will review and validate the operator's collection of basic data needed to calculate these indicators for each fiscal year in the triennium. The consultant will be expected to analyze performance indicators with the intent of identifying potential issues or concerns that may need further examination during the functional review.

The performance audit may include performance evaluations both for the entire system and for the system excluding special, new or expanded services instituted to test public transportation service growth potential. As part of the functional review described below, the consultant will be expected to select, calculate and analyze additional performance indicators, which are appropriate to identify, quantify and/or resolve performance problems and potential areas for improvement.

2.4. Review Operator Functions

The consultant will review each operator function, consistent with the Transportation Development Act. The functional review is expected to include interviews with the operator's management and staff.

Such concerns of inefficient or ineffective performance should lead to further investigation, which may include the verification and calculation of additional performance indicators. This detailed investigation of functional concerns, problems, and potential improvements should make up the basis of most findings in the audit report.

3. Presentations

3.1. Present to Transcom

The consultant will be required to present both the draft audit reports and the final audit report to Transcom, the Transit Operators Committee. A verbal presentation supplemented by copies of the reports is sufficient.

3.2. Present to the Ventura County Transportation Commission

The consultant will be required to present the final audit report to the VCTC. A verbal and PowerPoint presentation shall accompany the report.

3.3. Present to the Gold Coast Transit District

The consultant will be required to present the final audit report to the GCTD Board. A verbal and PowerPoint presentation shall accompany the report.

Deliverables

This project shall, at a minimum, include the following tasks and specific deliverables:

Task	Deliverables
1 Performance Audit of VCTC	Draft audit report, final audit reports
2 Performance Audit of Transit Operators	Draft audit report, final audit reports
3 Presentations	Present to Transcom, VCTC and GCTD

The draft audits can be submitted electronically. Please provide an electronic copy and seven (7) hard copies of the final audits.

TDA Performance Audit Schedule

The likely schedule for the TDA Performance Audit is as follows:

- Present draft Audit to Transcom - April 12, 2023
- Present final Audit to Transcom – May 10, 2023
- Present to Commission - June 2, 2023
- Present to GCTD Board - June 7, 2023
- Submit – June 15, 2023

The Consultant shall include a draft study schedule in their proposal and a final schedule within thirty (30) days of Notice to Proceed.

PROPOSAL REQUIREMENTS

Proposal Deadline

Five (3) hardcopies and one (1) electronic copy in PDF format on a USB flash drive of the Consultant's proposal shall be submitted **Friday, December 2, 2022** no later than **4:00 P.M.** (electronic submissions will not be accepted). **Proposals delivered after the stated date and time will not be considered and returned to the proposing firm unopened.** Proposals shall be delivered to the VCTC offices at:

Ventura County Transportation Commission
TDA Triennial Performance Audit

751 East Daily Drive, Suite 420
Camarillo, CA 93010

There is no expressed or implied obligation for the VCTC to reimburse responding firms for any expenses incurred in the preparation or delivery of proposals in response to this request. All proposals and material submitted will become the property of the VCTC and will not be deemed confidential or proprietary. The VCTC reserves the right to retain all proposals submitted and use any idea in a proposal regardless of whether that proposal is selected. All submissions are considered a matter of public record.

VCTC Contact Information

All questions, comments and proposals should be directed to:

Jeni Eddington, Administrative Assistant
Ventura County Transportation Commission
751 East Daily Drive, Suite 420
Camarillo, CA 93010
Phone: (805) 642-1591 (ext. 111)
Email: jeddington@goventura.org

Required Proposal Content

Proposals shall include the following required elements. Any proposal not containing the required elements will be deemed to be incomplete and removed from any further consideration.

1. **Title Page** - Indicate RFP subject, name of proposer's firm, address, telephone number, name of contact person, and date of proposal.
2. **Table of Contents** - Identify the material in the proposal by section and page number.
3. **Letter of Transmittal** - Briefly state the proposer's understanding of the work to be done and commit to perform the work within the specified time period and budget. The letter should be signed by someone authorized to bind the consultant team. Include the names and contact information of all subcontractors. Provide the names and titles of individuals authorized to represent the proposer. Letter should include acknowledgement of all addenda and proposed exceptions to the draft contract. Letter should be no longer than three pages.
4. **Profile of the Proposer** – Describe the firm’s resources and provide evidence that it has the ability to complete the work solicited by this RFP in the time frame proposed.
5. **Summary of Proposer's Qualifications** - Describe similar projects performed. Provide a list of references for which similar work has been performed, as well as references for any proposed subcontractors. Include sample reports or sample materials produced. Sample reports can be summarized here and submitted in an Appendix digitally.
6. **Proposed Staffing** – Provide a list of proposed staff, their qualifications and backgrounds identifying the proposed project manager and staff positions for the study. Indicate what proportion of their time key personnel will devote to this project and include statements that each of those key people have time to meet those obligations.
7. **Technical Approach** – Describe how the study is proposed to be conducted, including public outreach, data collection and compilation, analysis, consensus building and stakeholder

approvals. Describe project management techniques and strategies to insure quality and deliver project on time and within budget.

8. **Preliminary Schedule** - Provide a draft schedule for study completion.
9. **Cost Structure** - Provide a detailed cost breakdown, including estimated time by task, person, hourly rates, estimated travel time and travel expenses and materials cost.

Proposal Evaluation

Proposals will be reviewed by a consultant selection committee comprised of study stakeholders selected by VCTC. Interviews, if required by VCTC at its sole discretion, will be held at virtually on December 19, 2022. Each proposal will be scored according to the criteria below and the proposal receiving the highest score will be invited to negotiate an agreement for consultant services. If an agreement for consultant services cannot be reached, VCTC reserves the right to enter into negotiations with the next highest scoring proposer. In addition, VCTC reserves the right to select a proposal without conducting interviews or abandon this RFP. Final selection of a consultant and authority awarding the contract to proceed with these services shall be at the sole discretion of the VCTC Board.

VCTC reserves the right to award in whole or in part, by item or group of items, when such action serves the best interest of VCTC.

Proposals will be evaluated according to the following criteria:

<u>SCORE</u>	<u>CRITERIA</u>
30%	Qualifications – experience in performing work of a closely similar nature and size.
20%	Qualifications of Staffing - qualifications of project staff, logic of project organization, references.
30%	Work Plan – understanding of the purpose and requirements of the audit; approach to be followed and tasks to be performed; relative allocation of resources to key tasks; and proposed project schedule and ability to meet deadlines.
10%	Cost - Reasonableness of the total cost based on anticipated requirements; adequacy of data in support of figures quoted; basis on which prices are quoted.
10%	Completeness of Response - Completeness of response in accordance with RFP instructions; exceptions to or deviations from the RFP requirements that the Commission cannot or will not accommodate; other relevant factors not considered elsewhere.

The Consultant will be selected based on qualifications and demonstrated competence and the contract may not be awarded to the lowest responsible proposer. When selecting the Consultant, the skill and ability of the project team performing the services is a key component of the selection criteria.

Request for Proposal Schedule

Proposal schedule is subject to change. Firms considering responding to the RFP should monitor VCTC's website for changes. Firms that submit a proposal will be notified by email of any change in dates or times.

- Request for Proposal released: November 7, 2022
- Question submission period ends: November 16, 2022
- Questions answered: November 23, 2022
- Deadline for Proposal Submission – December 2, 2022 by 4:00pm
- Proposal review and evaluation: December 5 – December 16, 2022
- Oral interviews (if required): December 19, 2022
- Approximate Contract Award and Notice to Proceed: January 6, 2023

Additional Information

The complete Request for Proposal, questions and responses and the proposal results will be posted on VCTC's website at: <https://www.goventura.org/work-with-vctc/contracts/>

Form Consulting Services Agreement

A form Consulting Services Agreement is attached hereto and incorporated herein. Firms interested in responding to this RFP should be prepared to enter into the agreement under the standard terms and should be able to provide the required insurance. If the VCTC is unable to negotiate a satisfactory agreement with the top-ranked proposer, with terms and conditions the VCTC determines, in its sole judgment, to be fair and reasonable, then the VCTC may commence negotiations with the next most qualified proposer in sequence, until an agreement is reached or determination is made to reject all submittals. The VCTC and Consultant may agree to add additional work to the Project work scope by a later agreement. The VCTC may elect to stop work at any time in the contract and will pay for work completed to that point on a time and material basis.

Relationship to Final Agreement

This Request for Proposal shall be included in its entirety in any agreement between VCTC and the firm selected by the Consultant Selection Panel.

Attachments:

A. Form Consulting Services Agreement